

2003-10-06: Satipatthana Sutta (Week 6) - Feeling-Tone

Sat, 7/11 11:33PM • 40:50

SUMMARY KEYWORDS

unpleasant, pleasant, mindfulness, feeling, exercises, people, arise, experience, sensual, buddhist, practicing, unworldly, simplicity, simple, mind, translated, tone, interpretation, body, happiness

SPEAKERS

Gil Fronsdal

So, I'm about two thirds, finished or through with making commentary on the Satiputthana Sutta, which is the discourse the Buddha gave, or supposed to have given on the foundations of mindfulness or an establishment establishing a mindfulness. And there are something like 21 sections, or some people say 21 exercises in mindfulness in this little discourse. And each of these exercises are meant to be exercises that can cultivate mindfulness, develop mindfulness, they're considered appropriate places to place the attention so mindfulness can develop and there are places to develop that presence of mind that can bring with us in all kind of situations. As I've been saying, The way that the text is interpreted and developed interpretations have developed as practices down through the ages has changed the changes over time as these things do. And there are different ways of understanding this text. scholars who study the text will say that, you know, probably the Buddha didn't give this whole text as it's written. Because they see that a lot of the sections of the text a lot of these different exercises appear independently elsewhere in Buddhist canon. And so the thought is that probably at some point, all these independent little exercises would gather together in one place, and kind of a systematic hole. And, and then as this comes down to us as different Buddhist traditions, we'll divide up the text again in different parts. And we'll pick out those parts that seem most relevant to them or that speak to them most or seemed more suited to them something. So it's a fluid text and the exercises are fluid. One way of understanding the text, which I talked about in a talk almost a year ago now is that it could be seen as a progressive discussion, that the different exercises build on each other. And I liked that interpretation quite a bit. Because it begins with mindfulness of the body. And so much of the meditation practice in Buddhism, Buddhist spiritual development has to do with becoming embodied being in the body, and that then becomes the foundation for doing the other work. And, and overall, it's my impression, it's a lot healthier for everyone concerned, to have the body be the foundation for the spiritual work. And I know sometimes there's a tendency in spiritual circles for people to have a kind of disembodied spirituality, spirituality that's about particular states of mind or

particular experiences, it might have nothing to do with your body at all. And those kinds of things are talked about in Buddhism. But they're usually they happen after a person's really had this foundation in the body, you don't bypass the body, but you go through the body as a way of developing your practice. So it starts in the body. And then today, we're going to talk about the second foundation just for foundations. Today, we'll talk through all this discussion so far, I think we've maybe been talking about for eight or nine weeks though, it has been about mindfulness of the body, different exercises to do with the body. And now today, we're going to shift the discussion to what's called Mindfulness of feelings. So it turns out that it seems a lot easier to understand feelings if you kind of already in your body to some degree. And then from there, we'll go into the mind what's called a mindfulness of the mind. And it's considered a lot easier to be mindful of your mind. If you have know how to be mindful of feelings, and if you know how to be mindful of your body Then based on those four, three foundations, then the fourth foundation is something called Mindfulness of dogmas or dhammas. And we'll talk about that in a few weeks. But this is when you start to understand looking at the exercises given in this last section. There there they're focusing on those elements of the mind, or the heart, those those internal elements, that either lead us to greater bondage, greater suffering greater entanglement, with suffering, or the opposite that which leads to greater liberation. So looking at those particular elements, that either keep us enslaved or keep us suffering, or liberate us, and it ends with the last exercise being one of the most profound and in one hand, most

easiest Buddhist teachings to understand and the other hand, perhaps the most difficult one to understand least the most difficult to apply completely. And this whole exercise is 21 different exercises ends with developing mindfulness around the Four Noble Truths. And, and all this other stuff before that can be seen as a foundation to be able to really use the Four Noble Truths in a very deep penetrating way in your life. So that's one way I like that kind of interpretation to the text that it kind of just kind of develops that way. But there are certainly other ones and there's some teachers who focus almost primarily on one of the foundations as opposed to the other three. So for example, most common thing is to focus on mindfulness of the body, just put tremendous emphasis on that particular section. So now we're going to move into the mindfulness of feelings. Now, I'm not sure why these Western Buddhists who speak English persist including myself, I don't know why keep doing it. persist in translating this word as feelings. Word is better now. And when we say feelings in English, what do you think about? mindfulness? We're gonna talk about mindfulness of feelings. What's what is your, what's your association with that? Those of you don't know the technical Buddhist vocabulary. emotions, right? You can learn all about how are you mindful of your emotions, like happiness and anger and sadness and all these wonderful things, right? But that's not what is meant here. So it's confusing and sometimes when Buddhist Western Buddhist teachers talk about these, they kind of gloss over this a little bit too quickly, mindfulness of feelings as if, you know, of course, that's what I like to do. And you know, and even Bhikkhu Bodhi translates the students very definitive kind of, you know, text that looks very solid right, this is the, this is the kind of probably the most established translation to English now Is he also translated as feelings? A translation that I kind of like or translation which is maybe more like an explanation is the feeling tone, feeling tone of an experience or some I know some people translated as the hedonic tone. And because Buddhists are heated this

hedonic tone. The idea is that what we're talking about here is something very, very simple. And that is, that aspect of feeling that perceives registers things as being either pleasant, unpleasant, or neither unpleasant or pleasant. So that element of perception and recognition of feeling feeling tone. So there are things which maybe are You know, it's really obvious if someone someone takes a chalk and rubs you the wrong way across the chalkboard. It's intensely unpleasant for most people. And if someone comes along very gently in very warm soft hands strokes you know your cheek or gives you massage or something, it feels very pleasant experience is very pleasant or unpleasant certain music is experiences pleasant or unpleasant. I don't know if it's inherent in the music because music which was unpleasant when we were you know, anyway, things change. I remember the first time I watched the Beatles was on The Ed Sullivan Show with my mother and, and in Russia, he said she said in Norwegian, she said but do you understand when you understand it if I say it in English because it's almost the same words. She said, Oh, cut the music. Cat music these cats screeching and now she thinks it's great. So somehow was playing And unpleasant can change over time. And But anyway, that way we perceive something as being pleasant or unpleasant or neither. And that's kind of the simple one is when this is better now this foundation of mindfulness is discussed or usually explained, like on retreats, it's usually that's usually kind of the basic explanation that's given. And then sometimes people teachers will go and kind of give examples of how this works and talk about why this is a very important thing to do, which it is I'll do some of the same thing tonight. So now as that is with that as a background, I would like to read this section. And those of you who have heard teachings on this on the feeling tone, in bed, before on retreat, or here somewhere else should listen particularly carefully. To see if you have ever heard anything like this before.

And how big cruise does a big coup become means a monk but here It's understood to be anybody who is serious practitioner. And how monks, does a monk abide contemplating feeling as feeling? Sometimes this is translated as feeling in feeling, sometimes just translating, feeling in and of itself. How do you connect to the feeling, the feeling tone, in and of itself with kind of a kind of a simplicity, simplicity of being a simplicity of perception, where you're not going to experience it through a lot, a filter of a lot of interpretations or judgments, just in and of itself, just how it isn't the simplicity of it, no stories, no meaning making added to it. So you feel an itch, and suddenly, you think you have melanoma. You know, that's not experiencing the feeling in an in and of itself, that's adding layers of interpretation to it or suppositions or whatever. So to keep it really simple. How does it How does a monk keep it simple, and just Experience feeling as feelings. here when the feeling of pleasant feeling here when feeling a pleasant feeling, a monk understands I feel a pleasant feeling. When feeling a painful feeling, he or she understands, I feel a painful feeling. When feeling neither painful nor pleasant feeling, he or she understands. I feel a neither painful nor pleasant feeling when feeling so I'll read his translations for it. And now there is a warning to you. Other people have different translations what I'm about to read, and, and I don't think his friends his choice. His choice here is good. I'll offer you some later ones to talk about later. When feeling a worldly, pleasant feeling, he or she understands I feel a worldly, pleasant feeling. When feeling an unworldly, pleasant feeling, he or she understands. I feel an unworldly, pleasant feeling. When feeling a worldly, pleasant, painful feeling, he or she understands I feel a worldly, painful feeling. When feeling an unworldly, painful feeling, he or

she understands I feel an unworldly, painful feeling. When feeling a worldly, neither painful nor pleasant feeling, he or she understands I feel a worldly, neither painful nor pleasant feeling. When feeling unworldly, neither painful or pleasant feeling he or she understands I feel an unworldly, neither painful nor pleasant feeling. Now this is not going to make it into you know, the great spiritual quotes of all time You know, Buddhist books of inspirational writing, right? This doesn't kind of make you feel bubbly inside inspired. I don't think it does. But it's very, very straightforward. So it's almost kind of I don't know exactly what but like a manual or technical list, you know, when you feel x, you know, you're feeling x. When you feel why, you know, you're feeling why. So it's a kind of description of a very basic movement of mindfulness. And mindfulness is really simple. It's when x happens, you know, that axe is happening in and of itself. Mindfulness itself doesn't interpret it doesn't it doesn't judge the situation. That's why some people find mindfulness so liberating. And so happy making there was a person today that she felt so happy, because she realized that just to be mindful, just to be mindful was enough. She spent years practicing and doing everything else but you know, trying to be mindful budget. Just mindfulness was enough. And it made her happy just to be mindful of what was going wrong arising in a situation. So the basic movement of mindfulness is when something is happening in the simplicity of that experiencing, knowing what that experience is. And to say in the simplicity of the experience, it says a lot because of this tremendous tendency of human beings, to assign meaning and to judge and to personify it or to take it personally what's going on, we do all the stuff with it, rather than just experiencing it very simply. So here we have kind of a lengthy description of this process of experiencing something very simply. And maybe it is inspiring if you get into that kind of kind of what's being pointed to, in that. It's kind of very, if it resonates with you, having done this done this for yourself,

is a kind of tremendous refreshment of the mind. When the mind is able to just be in the present moment in the simplicity of this moment. This moment is what the experience is. When x happens, you know x is happening here in contemplating or being aware of Verdana, this feeling tone, there's this very simple thing of knowing that when a feeling when a perception or when it kind of whenever something registers being being unpleasant, you know that it's unpleasant. And when you register something as pleasant, you know that it's pleasant. And when it's neither of those, sometimes people say, translate this as being neutral. And there might be an important distinction between saying neutral and neither pleasant nor unpleasant. But I don't quite know what that distinction is. Myself, but often we say neutral. And

so you're just seeing it very simply. This is what's happening. Yes. Yeah, I'll get to that too, as I go through it. Thank you. And so when there's a painful feeling, when knows it's a painful feeling. One of the reasons why there's this particular exercise of seeing the feeling tone of our experience is considered one of the key elements towards learning to liberate the mind or the heart. So in in Buddhist kind of spirituality that comes out of this early tradition with us that uses mindfulness. This is a really key way of understanding our life is through the feeling tone of our experience. So stay with me now, because it's such an important one if I try to do my best here to make the theory is that all experience that we can experience will have one of those three elements as part of that experience.

It'll either be pleasant or it'll be unpleasant. Or in somehow and we neither neutral or something. Some of you might say, Well, yes, there's a fourth category, it can be both. At the same time, you're both pleasant and unpleasant. But there's this kind of, you know, as we have some experiences, and they can be very gross experiences, you know, tomorrow, you will, some of you will experience the election. And some of you will experience election as being unpleasant. And some of you will experience with being pleasant. And some of you will experience it as being neither and similar experiences both but it's actually you know, the whole the whole thing or different aspects of it, you know, as someone gets a head head in the in the in someone gets either gets ahead, depending who's ahead. It's pleasant or unpleasant the election, but the experience or the election is you know, somehow so that's very gross level, we can experience something at that level. And then at the very kind of minute level, it can be that way also that Simply the texture of your or the touch of your fingers against each other, can feel can feel pleasant, a little slow, but since she was kind of feeling there, or certain sounds can seem pleasant or unpleasant, certain sensations in the body, the breath can feel pleasant or unpleasant. The details of the breath there's a simple movement of very subtle little movement of the breath. As the diaphragm expands, that sense of expansion can feel pleasant, or it can feel unpleasant depending on how it's what's happening there. I remember so many times, not so many times, but enough times that I don't remember how many times practicing in Asia, in Thailand, and mostly in Thailand and India and Nepal, not some also everywhere practiced in Southeast Asia. Being on these long retreats How many times I was constipated. And, you know, if you're really constipated, and you're trying to follow your breath, you know, you're kind of bloated and it's not very pleasant the way it's unpleasant feeling. So, I don't know why to tell you that.

So the theory is that everything has this quality. We experience stuff. Then the idea is that in Buddhism, Buddhist psychology, is that a lot of the way in which we react to our experience is a reaction to whether it's pleasant or unpleasant, or neither. And I find it quite humbling or embarrassing to realize how much I am and I Many of human made human beings find themselves motivated by the simple Amoeba like pool towards pleasant and push away from unpleasant. And there's a lot of times people have tremendous justification for what they're doing. But at the very Genesis, justification arises out of justification of how it's okay to go towards the pleasant to experience that pleasure or avoid the discomfort, the unpleasant. And I suspect that sometimes whole political philosophies and their origin origins in a simple movement of pleasant and unpleasant certain things or unpleasant, certain experiences, certain kinds of people or whatever. And so then we try to create some philosophy that protects us from having contact with that kind of situation, that kind of person or whatever, because we think it's and so, this whole thing arises and one Exercise it's given quite frequently in Thailand, when you kind of kind of beginning exercises for learning mindfulness or learning how to how the body mind works is you're instructed to sit still in a chair, more or less sits in the chair. And then notice how many times you shift your posture and why you're shifting your posture. And the point of the exercise is to convey to people that the exercise works is that there's constantly little shifts in the posture that often has to do with moving away from discomfort, trying to make the body more comfortable. There's a constant movement going on. Except when you're meditating, right, because when we meditate, we sit still and if we can, and this isn't just, you know, gross movements,

but also movements of the mind. The mind itself in a sense moves or reacts to its contact with pleasant and unpleasant. So sometimes if something pleasant is there, the mind leans forward or kind of the whole body coming forward, we grab on to it or we we come out again so it's entangled in it because we like it and we get attached to it perhaps, if it's an unpleasant experience, the mind has other reactions to it, it the mind, also my contract or resist or pull away or have a whole other kind of strategies involved in trying to avoid something. One strategy is falling asleep or, you know, tuning out or numbing out when things are too unpleasant. And some people had felt great expertise and be able to do that to numb out. I was very good at doing this when I was maybe I think I was maybe 11 12 13 and I call it my Sears mind. And my mother would take me clothes shopping at Sears And this is something that I hated. And I would get so tired and so sleepy in those aisles at Sears. And then we would leave and she would say something like smile ice cream or something I'll leave, you know, she was I left. I was quite perky, you know. And that kind of sleepiness was a strategy of aversion of resistance of you know, it was a kind of way in responding to that unpleased what I thought were experiences that unpleasant situation. So what was Buddhist psychology teaches is that based on whether things are pleasant or unpleasant, there is some form of grasping that happens or craving and craving a shorthand for any driven movement where we're psyches driven, or feels composed to either resist push away or hold on to something. And it might be that some of you know you know, can resist a lot of things don't have that, you know, Something some some things you know, you go see, you know, you go you go by the store window and you see something really wonderful. You see, you know, a wonderful next generation of Palm Pilot or gameboy or something and, you know, that looks like a pleasant thing and you keep walking

there was a colon that I did for a couple of years I did co ons with Robert Akin rushy Cohen these kind of enigmatic kind of questions you have to kind of solve in a way and you kind of have you given it and then you have to kind of digest it for a while you go back into present it to the teacher and come back tomorrow kid you know, and then you try again and he's you know, you just try again, right? Yeah. But there was one I don't remember so well anymore, because we went through a whole series of them. But I think it had to do with you know how to handle design. Because I remember very well the answer. But the question was something like,

you know, I shouldn't probably say it, but the gist of it was some like, it's really beautiful, attractive, sexually attractive person for you comes along and smiles to you. What do you do? And don't this isn't that literal? Yeah. Remember this Cohen so well, but the answer was something like that at least the answer. The Zen master was happy with it I presented was, you smile, say hello and keep walking. So this idea of kind of, it's a pleasant situation and you don't grab on to the story. It's a similar story about Jim cemento in Thailand. And he was with Arjun Shah, his teacher and And I guess wouldn't be very beautiful woman came to the monastery and was talking to the two of them for a while and then she left. And I just said well, and Jensen Meadow said, I like but I don't want he appreciated it but he didn't. There's no desire there for it. So. So based on the feeling tone of an experience, there can be kind of a very raw, primitive, almost movement towards desire or aversion. And the opportunity that it said the opportunity exists is if you can notice the experience at the level of it being pleasant or unpleasant.

Then you have a chance of noticing that reaction that sets in, whether you're leaning forward to grab it, or whether you're pulling back or resisting it or getting angry or whatever. Whatever the reaction is, is the opportunity to see there. And it said that place we can see the difference between those two steps, the feeling tone of the experience and the desire, the craving that arises based on that. That is that in that gap between that, in that gap between those two is a place where you can find it's possible to liberate the mind. It's possible not to kind of just let go or in a sense or not to take that step or not to get involved with that clinging just leave it alone. Just let the feeling be as it is, appreciate what's pleasant. You know, experience the unpleasant. We don't do anything with it, then I don't have the mind getting reactive and caught up in it and assign meaning to it. Just let the simplicity of it just be a lot of people will say well, that's fine for the pleasant to watch. I do that with the unpleasant. When things are uncomfortable, isn't it reasonable to try to make yourself more comfortable it is reasonable to make yourself more comfortable. And in normal circumstances, it's good to do that. But in practice situations, one of the things that you know, when you're practicing practicing meditation, you don't want to be chasing after comfort all the time. What do you want to chase after if anything, is liberation is freedom is that ability of the mind to stay at peace and economists in the presence of any experience at all. And so if you feel discomfort in meditation, one of the really good choices you can make is to just learn how to work with that discomfort. until you find that place where the mind can be at peace. With the discomfort being there, it's okay for it to be there. Where the mind is not getting angry, hasn't gotten involved in either subtle or gross levels of reactivity to that being there. And it's a really wonderful training because if you wanted to be liberated, You need to have be able to be liberated in all circumstances, you know, you just liberated when things are pleasant. You know, I don't know if it's really a liberation. And also you don't never know what life is going to give you. And you never know when you can end up with some uncomfortable situation, that you have no choice but to experience. And if you've trained yourself through the practice, to when unpleasant situations arise, to stay with it and not try to manipulate or fix it, it gives you tremendous power and strength and flexibility to then learn how to find that in other unpleasant situations in life. So this ability to start tuning into the feeling tone of the experience is considered very important. And I know some practitioners who have made it one of the primary things they do in meditation sometimes where they just pay attention to the feeling tone of what's going on. Oh, that's pleasant, that's unpleasant, that's pleasant, that's unpleasant, and kind of whatever is arising. just noticing how that is, or it's neither Nordic nor neither.

And I haven't done a lot of this, I've done some of this. But some of my friends have done a lot of it say that for them, it's been very, very helpful to just tune into that aspect of experience. And you can imagine why it's useful now because so much of our reactivity arises out of our reaction to the pleasant and unpleasant. That makes sense. Okay. So it's a way of discovering kind of simplicity of being, when things arise, we let him be, we let ourselves be just let things be as they are. So then it goes on. So it describes you know, these these three categories, pleasant, painful, and either pleasant or a painful. Now as maybe this can be a footnote to the talk. The actual words in Pali for pleasant and unpleasant sukha and dukkha and when I saw this in Pali, I was quite surprised, because pleasant and unpleasant usual translation I've seen. And actually the words should more literally be translated into English as happiness and suffering. Dukkha is usually translated as suffering. And I don't know

why it's always translated as pleasant and unpleasant. But I think that the any, the, the understanding here is that we experience things as pleasant or unpleasant, or is a happy experience or an unhappy experience, both because it's inherent in experience, that it's a pleasant experience. And because of the way in which we do react to the experience, we interpret and all that. So for example, I don't know if this is a good analogy, but I know when I was young, the first time I tasted coffee and My thought was this tastes like dishwashing water. And then with time I learned to enjoy coffee. So I don't know if maybe coffees gotten better over the years. And that's what's happened. But I think there's such things as acquire tastes, certain things by association become more pleasant over time. And the story I'd like to tell is when I was a college student at Davis, UC Davis, you know, had this experience of riding through the truly fog in the wintertime, my bicycle without gloves, and my hands were bitterly cold so much that would take me a few minutes once I got the class to my thoughts, my hand so I can, I can actually take notes in class, it was that cold and it was biting and I used to go to our school feeling self pity. You know, feeling poor Gil, this is terrible suffering. And, and I wasn't smart enough to think about get clubs and register. And so then, but one day, I was doing this See the exercise of self pity, which I was getting good at. And then I remembered that the sensations I had in my hands, the biting painful sensations were the same sensations in my hand, as far as I could tell, that I used to have when I was a teenager, I go skiing. And then it was exhilarating. And the interpretation that pain depended a lot on, you know, whether it was painful or unpleasant or happy, or, you know, or unhappy kind of experience had a lot to do with levels of interpretation on top of it, because after I realized that connection to skiing, then I could go biking in there to the fog, same thing would happen, but it wouldn't bother me so much the pain, I realized when my mind was creating part of the, you know, intensity or the suffering of it all. So when it's set when the SEC says, either, you know, have a superduper happy or unhappy, I think it's pointing to the fact that you know, it really has to do with How we meet any experience, whether it's at a complicated level of lottery activity or very raw, simple, no reactivity. at any level, we can tune into how we experiencing this as a happy, unhappy, pleasant, unpleasant. Sometimes it's inherent in the inherent experience itself, that it's pleasant, unpleasant, and sometimes it's not inherent. But it has to do a lot with what we add to the experience that makes it a happy experience. We don't have the experience, regardless of what it is to notice it when you get happy to leave happiness alone. Because I know a lot of people who get attached to their happiness that causes problems, and a lot of people have get add suffering to their life, by resisting the unhappy by judging it and whatever. So this is an exercise in keeping to try and learning to keep things as simple as possible. And instead simplicity finding a kind of level of peace with our experience. Then it goes on to say when feeling worldly pleasant feeling, he or she understands I feel a worldly pleasant feeling.

And then ego says the same thing about the world the unpleasant and worldly, neither pleasant or unpleasant. The word for worldly. This is what I said earlier. I'm not very satisfied with this choice of world word presented later talks about unworldly world the other world, the unworldly, what's, you know what's, what's this? What's this about? And some people have suggested kind of value judgment, you know, unworldly. The word in Pali is some nissa. And near some Isa, near means negative or not. In some Isa, it means something like of the flesh, or meat, or carnal and some people translate this as sensual or something I've seen someplace carnal or pleasure. Pleasure flesh, I think

central works really well. So when you have essential, pleasant feeling, windows that essential pleasant feeling, when it's sensual, unpleasant feeling, when knows it's unset, central unpleasant feeling. So it's very simple as by the body the sense sensual experiences of life. And then unworlly is that that that which is pleasant but is not connected to the senses. And there's a whole host whole range of emotions and feelings that arise, independent of our sensual embodied experiences meditative experiences of joy or bliss, of equanimity of peace, that are said not to be born of our sensual body. There's often a confusion in society between sensual pleasure and happiness. And it's been argued that people who have some kind of addiction issue with alcohol or food or sex or sleep or whatever, that sometimes or maybe more often than not, that there's an element in that addiction of confusing, sensual pleasure for happiness, because it gives a kind of happy kind of pleasure that comes from these kinds of experiences. But it's not really happiness in long term, at least people feeling kind of empty. So here we're talking about so to recognize the difference between that which is sensual pleasantness versus that which is pleasantness which is not born from the senses. It's not a value judgment in each one. But there are two different categories of pleasant experiences two different categories of unpleasant experiences, based on whether they're essential or not sensual. And the suggestion here is that you should know that distinction. You should know when you have an essential, pleasant feeling. This is born from essential experience. When you have any a pleasant experience which doesn't seem to be connected to the senses. You know, that it's connected to the senses. That's, I think, I think it's very useful because as a person makes that distinction, then it's easier to recognize the kind of deep satisfaction, deeper peace, I suspect much deeper sense of satisfaction and sense of well being, that comes from that kind of pleasantness or joy or happiness, which is not born from the sensual world. And one of the key ways in which the Buddha found his enlightenment was that he remembered a capacity he had to experience joy, independent of sensual joy, of experiences sensuality of the body. And so then he went into that non sensual joy, as as a as a kind of doorway into that process led to his awakening.

So, so that's the exercise. And then there's the refrain, which is the same for every exercise, and really just part of the refrain in this way whereby it's contemplating feelings as feelings, internally and externally. And when a person is contemplating and feelings, the nature of their arising, how they arise, how they come into existence, when abides contemplating the feelings in their nature of vanishing, how they pass away, noticing how these arise and pass these things. And when a person is contemplating in the feelings, both they're arising, and they're passing away, or else, mindfulness that there is feeling is simply established in him or her, to the extent necessary for their knowledge and mindfulness. And he or she abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world. That is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating feeling as feeling. That's it. I hope it was a pleasant experience tonight. If it was not a pleasant experience, it's your responsibility. It's your responsibility of how you choose to react to that. And so I didn't mean to talk until nine o'clock. If some of you have questions about this topic. I thought maybe you could stay afterwards come up here afterwards or something, probably because it is unpleasant to be held back captive. And so thank you very much for your attention.